Cambridge International Examinations
Cambridge International General Certificate of Secondary Education

HISTORY **0470/23**

Paper 2 **May/June 2016**

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 50

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge is publishing the mark schemes for the May/June 2016 series for most Cambridge IGCSE®, Cambridge International A and AS Level components and some Cambridge O Level components.

® IGCSE is the registered trademark of Cambridge International Examinations.

This syllabus is approved for use in England, Wales and Northern Ireland as a Cambridge International Level 1/Level 2 Certificate.

© UCLES 2016

Option A: 19th Century topic

1 Study Sources A and B. How different are these two sources? Explain your answer using details of the sources. [7]

Level 5 Compares big messages **[7]**
Source A – Britain was in the wrong, Source B – China was in the wrong

Level 4 Agreement and disagreement of detail or sub-messages **[6]**

Level 3 Agreement or disagreement of detail or sub-messages **[3–5]**

Agreements:
Guangzhou was the only port open to foreign trade; the British began importing opium; the EIC's trade monopoly came to an end; the opium trade made the trade balance in favour of Britain; China used silver to buy the opium; Lin Zexu was appointed to deal with the opium problem; he confiscated stocks of opium; he arrested foreigners; Guangzhou was abandoned.

Disagreements:
In A the ending of the EIC monopoly was in 1834, in B it was in 1833.

Level 2 Identifies information that is in one source but not in the other or states that the sources are about the same subject **[2]**
OR
Compares the provenance of the sources

Level 1 Writes about the sources but makes no valid comparison **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016

2 Study Source C. How useful is this source as evidence about the First Opium War? Explain your answer using details of the source and your knowledge. [7]

Level 6 Explains what can be learned from its purpose in context of enforcement of opium trade or start of First Opium War **[7]**

Level 5 Interprets source and explains what we can learn from it **[5–6]**

China very angry about the opium trade, China wants the trade to stop, the trade is doing much harm to China
Award 6 marks if in context of the enforcement of the opium trade or beginning of First Opium War
OR
Evaluates source to reject it **[6]**

Level 4 Uses contextual knowledge to explain what it does not tell you **[4]**

Level 3 Undeveloped use of provenance – biased, written at the time **[3]**

Level 2 Paraphrases source to show usefulness **[2]**

Level 1 Unsupported assertions **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

3 Study Sources D and E. How similar are the messages of the two cartoonists? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge. [8]

Level 7 Compares cartoonists' views – they both disapprove of what the British are doing **[8]**

Level 6 Compares big messages **[6–7]**
In D the Chinese are happy to take the opium from the British, in E the British are forcing opium on the Chinese

Level 5 Explains big messages of source(s) – no comparison **[5]**

Level 4 Compares sub-messages of sources **[4]**

Level 3 Explains sub-messages of source(s) – no comparison **[3]**

Level 2 Compares provenance of sources **[2]**

Level 1 Surface description of sources **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016

4 Study Sources F and G. Does Source G prove that Source F is wrong? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge. [8]

Level 5 Compares the sources and evaluates one of them **[7–8]**

Level 4 Evaluates F but no valid use of G **[5–6]**

Level 3 Answers based on disagreements **[3–4]**

Level 2 Answers based on undeveloped provenance to say if G proves F is wrong or simply whether F is wrong **[2]**

Level 1 Writes about the sources but does not address the question **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

5 Study Source H. Are you surprised by this source? Explain your answer using details of the source and your knowledge. [8]

Level 7 Uses contextual knowledge or cross-reference to explain not surprised that an American is saying this to support Britain **[8]**

Level 6 Uses contextual knowledge or cross-reference to be surprised or not surprised by the overall attitude of Source H **[7]**

Level 5 Focuses on the provenance and explains whether surprised the magazine printed this speech **[6]**

Level 4 Matches or mismatches with other sources **[4–5]**

Level 3 Assertions based on everyday empathy **[3]**

Level 2 Valid analysis of source but fails to state whether surprised or not surprised **[2]**
OR
Identifies something that is surprising but no explanation
OR
Valid answer that fails to say whether surprised or not surprised

Level 1 Writes about sources but fails to address the question **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016

6 Study <u>all</u> the sources. How far do these sources provide convincing evidence that China was to blame for the First Opium War? Use the sources to explain your answer. [12]

Level 3 Uses sources to support and reject the statement **[7–10]**

- Award up to 2 bonus marks for evaluation of sources (no more than 1 per source).
- Source use must be reference to a source by letter, by provenance or by direct quote. There must be examples from source content. There must be an explanation of how this supports/does not support the statement.
- Use Y in the margin for each source use in support of the statement and N for each source use rejecting the statement.

Yes	No
B C G H	A C D E F

Level 2 Uses sources to support or reject the statement **[4–6]**

Level 1 No valid source use **[1–3]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016

Option B: 20th Century topic

1 Study Sources A and B. How different are these two sources? Explain your answer using details of the sources. [7]

Level 5 Compares big messages **[7]**
Big messages: A is anti-US/West or critical; B is pro US/West or justifying US/West

Level 4 Agreement and disagreement of detail or sub-messages **[5–6]**

Level 3 Agreement or disagreement of detail or sub-messages **[3–4]**

Agreements:
The US/West were determined to deal with Saddam (including destroy his military strength); UN passed resolutions; the West was on a war footing

Disagreements:
In A Iraq invaded on 3 August, in B it is the 2 August; in A the target was to deal with Iraq, in B it was to free Kuwait; in A Saddam offers to leave Kuwait, in B he refuses to leave; in A withdrawal from Kuwait was not enough for the US, in B it was; in A they want to destroy Iraq, but in B they just want to destroy his military strength

Level 2 Identifies information that is in one source but not in the other or states that the sources are about the same subject **[2]**
OR
Compares the provenance of the sources

Level 1 Writes about the sources but makes no valid comparison **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016

2 Study Sources C and D. Does Source D make Source C surprising? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge. [8]

Level 6 Compares the sources and evaluates one to say if D makes C surprising **[8]**

Could be based e.g. on the difference of attitude of the US as the starting point or on the fact that Iraq was happy to have negotiations in both. The evaluation might well be based on the time difference between the two sources or on use of cross-reference.

Level 5 Explains surprise/no surprise for C but no valid use of D **[6–7]**

Level 4 Answers using content agreements and disagreements to explain if D makes C surprising **[5]**

Level 3 Answers using content agreements or disagreements to explain if D makes C surprising **[3–4]**

Level 2 Answers based on undeveloped provenance **[2]**
OR
Identifies something surprising/not surprising in C but no explanation
OR
Valid answer but fails to say if C is surprising

Level 1 Writes about the sources but does not address the question **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

3 Study Source E. What is the message of this cartoon? Explain your answer using details of the source and your knowledge. [8]

Level 5 Explains point of view of cartoonist **[7–8]**
Criticising Bush for being ready to sacrifice US lives for oil, criticising Bush for getting involved because of the US deaths

Level 4 Explains big message **[5–6]**
The war will lead to US deaths

Level 3 Sub-message explained **[3–4]**
e.g. There will be US deaths, the war is over oil

Level 2 Plausible misinterpretations **[2]**

Level 1 Surface description of source **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016

4 Study Sources F and G. How far do these two cartoonists agree? Explain your answer using details of the sources and your knowledge. [8]

Level 6 Compares big messages – must be cartoonists' points of view **[8]**
e.g. F is blaming Saddam while G is blaming both US and Saddam

Level 5 Compares sub-messages (or sub compared with big) **[6–7]**
e.g. There is no role for diplomacy in either

Level 4 Explains big messages of source(s) – no comparison **[4–5]**
Must be cartoonist's point of view, e.g. in F Saddam was to blame, in F Saddam has to be stopped because he will not stop with Kuwait

Level 3 Explains sub-messages of source(s) – no comparison **[3]**
e.g. Saddam was like Hitler in F, diplomacy doesn't stand a chance in G, there will be war in G, G is criticising only US or Saddam

Level 2 Compares provenance of sources **[2]**

Level 1 Surface description of sources **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

5 Study Source H. How useful is this source to a historian studying events in the Gulf in 1990–91? Explain your answer using details of the source and your knowledge. [7]

Level 6 Explains what can be learned from its purpose in context of UN resolution/eve of war **[7]**

Level 5 Interprets source and explains what we can learn from it **[5–6]**
Either Iraq refusing to cooperate or US expecting nothing from Iraq at this stage
Award 6 marks if in context of UN resolution/eve of war
OR
Evaluates source to reject it **[6]**
Based on negative view of Iraq given by US

Level 4 Uses contextual knowledge to explain what it does not tell you **[4]**

Level 3 Undeveloped use of provenance – biased, written at the time **[3]**

Level 2 Paraphrases source to show usefulness **[2]**

Level 1 Unsupported assertions **[1]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016

6 Study <u>all</u> the sources. How far do these sources provide convincing evidence that the USA was responsible for the outbreak of military hostilities in January 1991? Use the sources to explain your answer. [12]

Level 3 Uses sources to support and reject the statement **[7–10]**

- Award up to 2 bonus marks for evaluation of sources (no more than 1 per source).
- Source use must be reference to a source by letter, by provenance or by direct quote. There must be examples from source content. There must be an explanation of how this supports/does not support the statement.
- Use Y in the margin for each source use in support of the statement and N for each source use rejecting the statement.

Yes	No
A B D E G H	B C D F G H

Level 2 Uses sources to support or reject the statement **[4–6]**

Level 1 No valid source use **[1–3]**

Level 0 No evidence submitted or response does not address the question **[0]**

© Cambridge International Examinations 2016