Cambridge Assessment International Education

Cambridge International AS & A Level

HISTORY **9489/12**

Paper 1 Document question **May/June 2023**

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 40

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge International will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge International is publishing the mark schemes for the May/June 2023 series for most Cambridge IGCSE, Cambridge International A and AS Level and Cambridge Pre-U components, and some Cambridge O Level components.

© UCLES 2023

Generic Marking Principles

These general marking principles must be applied by all examiners when marking candidate answers. They should be applied alongside the specific content of the mark scheme or generic level descriptors for a question. Each question paper and mark scheme will also comply with these marking principles.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 1:

Marks must be awarded in line with:

- the specific content of the mark scheme or the generic level descriptors for the question
- the specific skills defined in the mark scheme or in the generic level descriptors for the question
- the standard of response required by a candidate as exemplified by the standardisation scripts.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 2:

Marks awarded are always **whole marks** (not half marks, or other fractions).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 3:

Marks must be awarded **positively**:

- marks are awarded for correct/valid answers, as defined in the mark scheme. However, credit is given for valid answers which go beyond the scope of the syllabus and mark scheme, referring to your Team Leader as appropriate
- marks are awarded when candidates clearly demonstrate what they know and can do
- marks are not deducted for errors
- marks are not deducted for omissions
- answers should only be judged on the quality of spelling, punctuation and grammar when these features are specifically assessed by the question as indicated by the mark scheme. The meaning, however, should be unambiguous.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 4:

Rules must be applied consistently, e.g. in situations where candidates have not followed instructions or in the application of generic level descriptors.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 5:

Marks should be awarded using the full range of marks defined in the mark scheme for the question (however; the use of the full mark range may be limited according to the quality of the candidate responses seen).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 6:

Marks awarded are based solely on the requirements as defined in the mark scheme. Marks should not be awarded with grade thresholds or grade descriptors in mind.

© UCLES 2023

Part (a)	Generic Levels of Response:	Marks
Level 4	**Makes a developed comparison** Makes a developed comparison between the two sources. Explains why points of similarity and difference exist through contextual awareness and/or source evaluation.	**12–15**
Level 3	**Compares views and identifies similarities and differences** Compares the views expressed in the two sources, identifying differences and similarities and supporting them with source content.	**8–11**
Level 2	**Compares views and identifies similarities or differences** Identifies relevant similarities or differences between the two sources and the response may be one-sided with only one aspect explained. **OR** **Compares views and identifies similarities and differences but these are asserted rather than supported from the sources** Identifies relevant similarities and differences between the two sources without supporting evidence from the sources.	**4–7**
Level 1	**Describes content of each source** Describes or paraphrases the content of the two sources. Very simple comparisons may be made (e.g. one is from a letter and the other is from a speech) but these are not developed.	**1–3**
Level 0	**No creditable content.** **No engagement with source material.**	**0**

Part (b)	Generic Levels of Response:	Marks
Level 5	**Evaluates the sources to reach a supported judgement** Answers are well focused, demonstrating a clear understanding of the sources and the question. Reaches a supported judgement about the extent to which the sources support the statement and weighs the evidence in order to do this.	**21–25**
Level 4	**Using evaluation of the sources to support and/or challenge the statement** Demonstrates a clear understanding of how the source content supports and challenges the statement. Evaluates source material in context, this may be through considering the nature, origin and purpose of the sources in relation to the statement.	**16–20**
Level 3	**Uses the sources to support and challenge the statement** Makes valid points from the sources to both challenge and support the statement.	**11–15**
Level 2	**Uses the sources to support or challenge the statement** Makes valid points from the sources to either support the statement or to challenge it.	**6–10**
Level 1	**Does not make valid use of the sources** Describes the content of the sources with little attempt to link the material to the question. Alternatively, candidates may write an essay about the question with little or no reference to the sources.	**1–5**
Level 0	**No creditable content.** **No engagement with source material.**	**0**

© UCLES 2023

Question	Answer	Marks
1(a)	**Read Sources A and D.** **Compare and contrast these two sources as evidence of views about Calonne.** Indicative content **Similarities include:** • Both sources agree that the situation in which Calonne finds himself is very difficult as both admit that the financial situation in France is dire. • The sources agree that Calonne has some supporters. **Source A** suggests he has friends who are 'warm in their praises of him'. **Source D** supports this idea by the suggestion that Calonne had won round many of the Notables until Brienne intervened. (the author could be described as a supporter of Calonne which backs up the point made in **A**.) **Differences include:** • The sources disagree on whether Calonne has anything useful to contribute to the situation. **Source A** implies that he is unequal to the situation and won't achieve anything. On the other hand, **Source D** describes Calonne's plan as 'bold and wide-ranging' and containing 'useful insights'. • Calonne's involvement in calling the Assembly is portrayed differently. In **Source A** he is described as being in a situation of 'financial embarrassment which he cannot resolve' and the King credited as being responsible for the Assembly. In **Source D** Calonne is the inspiration behind the meeting as he has come up with the plan which the King has approved. **Explanation** *An explanation of the financial state of France might account for the similarities between the sources about the situation facing Calonne. Involvement in a variety of wars had ruined France. For instance, the American War of Independence had cost France over 1000 million livres which was paid for by raising loans. By 1782 the treasury was 295 million livres short of what it required for state expenditure. This was an increase of almost 70% on the previous year. As outsiders, the British were aware of the financial situation facing France and that Calonne was partly responsible. Both agree that Calonne had supporters and these may have included members of the nobility who hoped Calonne's plans would save them from a more severe solution.*	**15**

Question	Answer	Marks
1(a)	***Sources A's*** *scathing approach might be explained with reference to Calonne's policies, pursued after the dismissal of Necker in 1781, of raising loans and selling offices. On the other hand, it is not surprising that a French nobleman, looking back on the situation after the revolution, would take a different view. He sees Calonne's plan in a positive light and in retrospect may think that the monarchy could have been saved by more decisive action in 1787.* ***Source D*** *sees Calonne as a positive influence who was let down by intrigue and the weakness of the King. This view could be influenced by knowledge of what happened in the intervening years.* Accept any other valid responses	

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	**Read <u>all</u> of the sources.** **'The Assembly of Notables was likely to fail.' How far do these sources support this view?** Indicative content **Support:** • **Source A:** the source states that it is highly unlikely that Calonne can solve the problems facing the Assembly and that the fact it has been called suggests the debt must be massive. The source also suggests that attempts to find a solution to massive spending on the 'establishment of the royal family' have failed. • **Source B:** the cartoon implies that the Notables must vote to have themselves eaten for the Assembly to achieve its aims. They must make a sacrifice and their refusal to answer Calonne's question suggests this is unlikely. • **Source D:** The author does say that the 'Notables were naturally bound to oppose the ending of abuses from which they profited'. **Challenge:** • **Source C:** the King is upbeat about the prospects of the Assembly. He has large and important plans which he is determined to pursue and places his trust in the nobles to advise him well and pull in the same direction. • **Source D:** this source argues that although the Assembly failed, this wasn't inevitable. Calonne's plan is described as 'bold and wide-ranging'. The author argued that the nobles were well-intentioned and would have gone along with Calonne's plan if it had not been for the Bishop of Toulouse and being betrayed by the King. **Evaluation** ***Source A:*** *is from a British diplomat who belittles Calonne but praises the King for calling the Assembly. The source seems unwilling to directly blame the King himself for the financial state of France, arguing that the 'royal court'' is at fault for the huge debt (possibly referring to the Queen). Candidates could use their contextual knowledge to support this view. Marie Antoinette was widely thought to be extravagant, for instance spending 400 000 livres on a diamond necklace in 1776.* ***Source B:*** *this satirical cartoon shows that few were convinced that the Assembly of Notables would work. The Notables included leading members of the parliaments, princes, noblemen and bishops. Some of them had benefited from the sale of offices which was conducted to raise money in the early 1780s and members of the nobility were exempt from paying tax. This would change if Calonne's plans were accepted as a single land tax would come into force which would mean any landowner, whatever their status, would be taxed.*	**25**

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	***Source C:*** *it is not surprising that the King was upbeat about the prospects for the Assembly in his opening speech. However, it had taken a great deal of persuasion to get him to agree to convening the Assembly of Notables. He is keen to emphasise the public benefits which would result from Calonne's plans. It was rare for the King to consult on any issues and he expected the Notables to be a pliant group.* ***Source D:*** *written after the revolution, this source has the benefit of hindsight and the author clearly regrets that Calonne's plans were not accepted. The author blames the King for abandoning Calonne and replacing him with Brienne. However, Brienne was no more successful than Calonne in pushing reform through and the failure of the Assembly to solve the financial crisis facing France was one of the main reasons for the convocation of the Estates General in 1789. The author of this source was aware of the impact on subsequent events. The source could be questioned as the writer blames the King, but describes his fellow Notables as 'well-intentioned', absolving himself from blame.* Accept any other valid responses.	

Question	Answer	Marks
2(a)	**Read Sources B and C.** **Compare and contrast the views in these two sources about the impact of the eight-hour day.** Indicative content **Similarities include:** • **Source B** indicates that the 8-hour day might lead to a decrease in production while **Source C** argues that it would decrease production. • **Source B** maintains that the 8-hour day will give workers more leisure, while **Source C** concedes that it would have the same effect. • **Source B** suggests that the 8-hour day would increase employment while **Source C** also suggests this, even if it was only in the short term. **Differences include:** • **Source B** maintains that the shorter day would overall increase consumption while **Source C** is adamant that it would not. • **Source B** suggests that it would increase national wealth while **Source C** disagrees with this. • **Source B** suggests that it would decrease poverty while **Source C** argues that it would increase it. **Explanation** *The two sources are aimed at very different audiences. In **Source B** the President of a Union is making a case to a Senate Committee on behalf of his members and is bound to present the case in most favourable light. With Congress in a position to strongly influence such an issue, he is obviously going to highlight the positives. **Source C** shows the opinions of the employers as reported to the government so has its own perspective which is clearly focused on not restricting work hours. Contextual knowledge can be used here to discuss more about the debate on working hours.* Accept any other valid responses.	**15**

Question	Answer	Marks
2(b)	**Read all of the sources.** '**The growth of workers' unions would benefit the US economy.' How far do the sources support this view?** Indicative content **Support includes:** • **Source B:** strongly supports the argument. It is trying to appeal to members while at the same time trying to assuage fears of employers who saw unions as a threat and violators of the laissez-faire principles of the era. Unions would not only end mass poverty but would assist in the ending of financial panics which did so much damage to the American economy in the period. It focuses on the damage that such wealth accumulation can do. It also stresses the fact that this union would encourage arbitration which would lessen the chance of a strikes which would naturally damage an economy. • **Source D:** contains both sides of the argument, but clearly is more strongly in support of it. There are 'unwarranted' strikes which are economically damaging. However, Roosevelt stresses the highly positive 'possibilities' of unions. He argues that they are both 'necessary and beneficial' and sees them as being important to the development of 'industrial' democracy as well as 'political' democracy in the United States. They have a role to play in ending 'want and degradation'. **Challenge includes:** • **Source A:** does not support the argument. While the 'good' worker and his family are off to the savings bank with their money, the Union supporter is giving money to the unions. The damage done by the unions is made clear in the chart. Families would be ruined, inferior and presumably inefficient, workers would get jobs. Unions would close the avenues to capital, therefore damaging investment. Every man would have the right to possess what he did not possess and huge amounts of time would be spent arranging more damaging strikes. It is consistently hostile. • **Source C:** firmly disagrees with the hypothesis. Not only is there strong opposition to the unions' advocacy for the eight-hour day and all that it might lead to, but there are other serious issues which a growth of union power might lead to. There is the reference there to the 'threat to good management' as well as the adverse effect on share prices and overall damaging impact of the national economy. • **Source D:** does include some challenge – There are 'unwarranted' strikes which are economically damaging. **Evaluation** ***Source A*** *It is a cartoon, a format not usually known for impartiality, and will exaggerate to reinforce a point.* ***Source B:*** *Given that the source comes from the president of a union presenting evidence to Congress, it is bound to be supportive of the role of unions in the wider economy.*	**25**

Question	Answer	Marks
2(b)	***Source C:*** *United States Steel was well known for its bitter hostility to unions in any form and had used very harsh methods to end strikes in its Pennsylvania steel works.* ***Source D:*** *Roosevelt had played an important role in trying to bring industrial peace to the United States, and unlike his predecessors, had intervened on the side of Unions in several major cases- the Coal Strike of 1902 in particular. He had been strongly criticised for his sympathetic attitude towards unions, and was perhaps trying to explain his reasoning.* Accept any other valid responses.	

Question	Answer	Marks
3(a)	**Read Sources B and C.** **Compare and contrast these two sources as evidence about the economic impact of colonies.** Indicative content **Similarities include:** • Some agreement that the colonies are a potential source of wealth. **Source B's** 'great riches' and **Source C's** identification of the 'acquisition of gold, gold, and more gold' both show this. • They both indicate that the economic benefits are limited, at least in the short-term. There is the sense that they will not be immediate in **Source B**, as there will be an initial need to 'to pay many subsidies'. **Source C** speaks of the 'millions' which will need to be spent by the state. **Differences include:** • In **Source B**, there is a very positive view of the long-term economic benefits, as colonies will lead to 'great riches'. These will arise from the market for German 'industrial products' and the supply of 'colonial products'. This contrasts with the negative tone of **Source C** in terms of benefits for the German public. It asserts that 'millions are to be spent from the pockets of the taxpayers' to support the colonialists. The 'funds of the Reich' are only helping the East Africa Company. • **Source B** identifies benefits for both sides from the economic relationship, seen in the development of a 'firm and steady interchange' between 'either side'. **Source C** regards the relationship as 'exploiting the African population'. **Explanation** *The similarities and differences show two contrasting views of the potential economic consequences, and derive from the standpoint of their authors. The missionary is concentrating on the benefits of colonialism, and is trying to win the German public over to his view at a time when this was still not general. His book also reflects the mixed motives of many European missionaries at the time.* *The socialist politician is also trying to influence his audience, the members of the Reichstag, at a time when colonialism had gained wider support. His perspective is rooted in his political belief in equality and his distrust of the commercial motives of German business. He is speaking shortly after a rebellion by East Africans against German colonisers.* *They both can be linked to the context of Bismarck's conversion to the pursuit of colonies around 1884, and his preference for supporting the expansion of German commercial interests in the form of chartered companies such as the East Africa Company.* Accept any other valid responses.	**15**

Question	Answer	Marks
3(b)	**Read <u>all</u> of the sources.** **How far do the sources agree that there was support in Germany for the acquisition of colonies?** Indicative content **Support includes:** • **Source B:** Claims that the German public 'fully supports the German Reich's need for colonial possessions.' This is linked to the potential economic benefits, and the 'navy which is growing mightily'. There is also a reference to the way in which it will allow emigration to benefit 'the mother country'. • **Source D:** Refers to the idea of 'a place in the sun' and German Weltpolitik. It claims great unity in this 'dream' as many groups of people 'declared with one voice: We *must* have real colonies'. Here the main motive is the needs of German emigrants, which can be cross-referenced to Source B. **Challenge includes:** • **Source A:** Bismarck is clearly opposed to the acquisition of colonies at this point, on the grounds that 'colonies could only be defended by powerful fleets' and he did not aspire to be a great naval power. He even claims to have been offered colonies which 'he had rejected'. However, he clearly has some interests in expanding German trade, which will require the establishment of 'refuelling bases' to supply German shipping. • **Source C:** Any enthusiasm for colonies **'**has disappeared' as 'the colonial question leaves the vast majority of the German people cold to the very core'. The reasons given are humanitarian, as the socialist politicians are 'opponents of any form of oppression' and also the fact that only a few German companies would benefit financially. **Evaluation** ***Source A*****:** *Bismarck is speaking in 1873, and the British diplomat is keen to show it was a private and reliable conversation. Bismarck is certainly trying to reassure the British that his country poses no threat and it is true that at this time he was more concerned to preserve Germany's dominant position in Europe.* ***Source B:*** *This reflects the change of attitude in Germany, as even Bismarck was persuaded of the economic value of some colonies, at least for a time. The author clearly has a motive in encouraging increased German influence, which would facilitate his organisation's missionary work. Here, he only develops economic arguments for colonies.*	**25**

Question	Answer	Marks
3(b)	***Source C:*** *The challenge from an opposition left-wing politician echos some of Bismarck's concerns about the cost outweighing any benefits, but from a very different perspective. There is reference to the East Africa Company; 'chartered company' land management was initially preferred to the establishment of colonial government as it was not such a great financial commitment. The Company proved ineffective and was taken over by the German government in 1891. The author was a founder member of a socialist party which held Marxist economic views, was effectively banned by Bismarck in 1878, and which frequently denounced brutality against Africans and. Thus, he shows a minority view in his criticism of German colonial policy on moral grounds.* ***Source D:*** *can be cross-referenced to Source B as both make claims of wide-spread enthusiasm, and links to national pride and the need to benefit from the emigration of the surplus German population. This is despite the fact that they are separated by nearly three decades, and that they are written by a German and British author respectively. They reflect a growing sense of German nationalism, and that colonies were a source of status as well as bringing some potential economic benefits. There is reference to the policy of Weltpolitik associated with Kaiser Wilhelm II and the German Foreign Secretary Bernhard von Bülow who said, in 1897, 'we demand our own place in the sun'.* *In fact, neither the emigration nor the trade motive brought the benefits suggested: in 1914 the total German population in the colonies was still less than the German population of Paris and in 1913 Germany's trade with her own colonies accounted for only 0.1 per cent of her total trade.* Accept any other valid responses.	