Cambridge Assessment International Education

Cambridge International AS & A Level

HISTORY **9489/13**

Paper 1 Document Question 13 **May/June 2022**

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 40

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge International will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge International is publishing the mark schemes for the May/June 2022 series for most Cambridge IGCSE, Cambridge International A and AS Level and Cambridge Pre-U components, and some Cambridge O Level components.

© UCLES 2022

[Turn over

Generic Marking Principles

These general marking principles must be applied by all examiners when marking candidate answers. They should be applied alongside the specific content of the mark scheme or generic level descriptors for a question. Each question paper and mark scheme will also comply with these marking principles.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 1:

Marks must be awarded in line with:

- the specific content of the mark scheme or the generic level descriptors for the question
- the specific skills defined in the mark scheme or in the generic level descriptors for the question
- the standard of response required by a candidate as exemplified by the standardisation scripts.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 2:

Marks awarded are always **whole marks** (not half marks, or other fractions).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 3:

Marks must be awarded **positively**:

- marks are awarded for correct/valid answers, as defined in the mark scheme. However, credit is given for valid answers which go beyond the scope of the syllabus and mark scheme, referring to your Team Leader as appropriate
- marks are awarded when candidates clearly demonstrate what they know and can do
- marks are not deducted for errors
- marks are not deducted for omissions
- answers should only be judged on the quality of spelling, punctuation and grammar when these features are specifically assessed by the question as indicated by the mark scheme. The meaning, however, should be unambiguous.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 4:

Rules must be applied consistently, e.g. in situations where candidates have not followed instructions or in the application of generic level descriptors.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 5:

Marks should be awarded using the full range of marks defined in the mark scheme for the question (however; the use of the full mark range may be limited according to the quality of the candidate responses seen).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 6:

Marks awarded are based solely on the requirements as defined in the mark scheme. Marks should not be awarded with grade thresholds or grade descriptors in mind.

© UCLES 2022

Part (a)	Generic Levels of Response:	Marks
Level 4	**Makes a developed comparison** Makes a developed comparison between the two sources. Explains why points of similarity and difference exist through contextual awareness and/or source evaluation.	**12–15**
Level 3	**Compares views and identifies similarities and differences** Compares the views expressed in the two sources, identifying differences and similarities and supporting them with source content.	**8–11**
Level 2	**Compares views and identifies similarities or differences** Identifies relevant similarities or differences between the two sources and the response may be one-sided with only one aspect explained. **OR** **Compares views and identifies similarities and differences but these are asserted rather than supported from the sources** Identifies relevant similarities and differences between the two sources without supporting evidence from the sources.	**4–7**
Level 1	**Describes content of each source** Describes or paraphrases the content of the two sources. Very simple comparisons may be made (e.g. one is from a letter and the other is from a speech) but these are not developed.	**1–3**
Level 0	**No creditable content.** **No engagement with source material.**	**0**

Part (b)	Generic Levels of Response:	Marks
Level 5	**Evaluates the sources to reach a supported judgement** Answers are well focused, demonstrating a clear understanding of the sources and the question. Reaches a supported judgement about the extent to which the sources support the statement and weighs the evidence in order to do this.	**21–25**
Level 4	**Using evaluation of the sources to support and/or challenge the statement** Demonstrates a clear understanding of how the source content supports and challenges the statement. Evaluates source material in context, this may be through considering the nature, origin and purpose of the sources in relation to the statement.	**16–20**
Level 3	**Uses the sources to support and challenge the statement** Makes valid points from the sources to both challenge and support the statement.	**11–15**
Level 2	**Uses the sources to support or challenge the statement** Makes valid points from the sources to either support the statement or to challenge it.	**6–10**
Level 1	**Does not make valid use of the sources** Describes the content of the sources with little attempt to link the material to the question. Alternatively, candidates may write an essay about the question with little or no reference to the sources.	**1–5**
Level 0	**No creditable content.** **No engagement with source material.**	**0**

© UCLES 2022

Question	Answer	Marks
1(a)	**How far do these sources agree about Nicholas II's decision to take command of the Russian forces?** Indicative content **Similarities** • Both sources show a mystical or religious overtone to the way Nicholas saw his role as war leader. In Source C, which mentions 'Holy Russia' Nicholas looks heavenward while a priest blesses the troops in the background. In Source B the Tsar considers it his 'sacred duty' to be with the army. The Tsar's desire to lead the troops is described as 'mystical feelings'. • Both show Nicholas' dedication to Russia. He wants to be their leader in Source B and regrets that he did not lead the troops against the Japanese. Source C shows him boldly stepping out alone to defend 'Holy Russia.' • There is some evidence of support for his actions in both sources, the troops seem to be starting to follow him in Source C and the Council of Ministers are told to support him in Source B (although with misgivings). **Differences** • Source B shows his decision to be rather unwise and focuses on his stubbornness rather than his bravery. Source C suggests Nicholas action to lead the troops is brave. He is shown striding out to fight. • The sources disagree about the popularity of Nicholas' decision to lead the troops. It is clear from Source B that the Council of Ministers would prefer him not to takeover command of the army. However, Source C suggests that people will follow Nicholas, the troops on the left seem to be moving forward with him. The source is also produced by one of Russia's allies who see his action as noble. **Explanation** *Source B is unusual in that Goremykin is critical of Nicholas (he was fanatically loyal) but it is not surprising that he bows before the will of the Tsar and asks the Ministers to help him. The Council criticised Nicholas' decision and, as a result, most of them were dismissed.* *Source B portrays the war as a disaster and contextual knowledge can be used to support those claims. By the autumn of 1915 Russian forces had lost the gains made in 1914 and were forced out of Poland, Lithuania and Latvia. Between May and December 1915 over a million Russian troops were killed and roughly the same number taken captive. This contrasts starkly with the more positive image given in Source C. Source C is produced by one of Russia's allies in the First World War. Therefore, it is not surprising that this source gives an impression of Nicholas as brave and fearless. Stronger fighting on the Eastern Front would help to distract German forces on the Western Front.* Accept any other valid responses.	**15**

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	**Read <u>all</u> the sources 'It was likely that Russia would be defeated in the First World War.' How far do these sources support this view?** Indicative content **Support** • Source B: this source mentions that the war is going very badly (virtually a catastrophe) and that the army is exhausted. The Tsar's decision to lead is a great risk and the ministers want him to wait until a more favourable time. All this suggests that Russia is doing badly in the war and could well be defeated. • Source D: This source suggests that Russia is not capable of fighting the war. After only three months the professional soldiers have been killed or injured and the army is made up of ill-trained conscripts who can't load a rifle, let alone shoot. **Challenge** • Source A: The war is shown as a unifying factor and the writer is confident that Russia will be victorious. Political parties have dropped their opposition and believe the war is justified and necessary. This suggests there will be a united effort to defeat Germany. • Source C: The Tsar is brave and fearless in fighting for his country. His soldiers are willing to follow him. His allies support his brave decision. **Evaluation** *Source A suggests national unity and confidence in victory, but it is early in the war and the writer is not in Russia. A negative view of the probable outcome of the war for the Allies was unlikely to be published. By September 1914, the Russia second army had been all but destroyed at Tannenberg.* *Source C is a British cartoon and could be seen to support Nicholas. They are likely to support their ally (and relative of the British King) and this might make the source less reliable.* *Source B has a more realistic view of the war and can be assessed using contextual knowledge. By the end of 1915, over 1.5 million men had been killed or wounded in the Russian forces.* *Source D is from General Brusilov and shows the extremely poor state of the Russian forces and how they were already in a dreadful position before the end of 1914. Candidates may be aware of Brusilov's position, and his offensive in 1916, which lends credibility to what he says. However, they could also see his account as justifying himself in the light of Russia's eventual defeat.* Accept any other valid responses.	**25**

Question	Answer	Marks
2(a)	**To what extent do these two sources agree about the leadership of President Davis?** Indicative content **Similarities between the Sources include:** • Source B does contain criticism of President Davis, suggesting that he was not popular with the soldiers and that they were 'not enthusiastic' about him. While they were not disrespectful towards him, there was no longer 'admiration' for him. Source C is also critical in tone, reporting that many 'attacked and criticised' the President, and that he was responsible for a failure to pursue a defeated Union army after the battle of Bull Run. There is also the criticism that there was too little food, equipment and transportation to enable the Southern army to defeat the North. **Differences include:** • Source B is more critical of the President, and for different reasons. There is criticism of his choice of commander for the army and that he should have promoted the 'able Johnston'. There is also the criticism there over his lack of honesty about the performance of the army overall and the fact that there had been a 'large number of deserters'. Whereas Source C is more positive towards the President and more inclined to defend him. It suggests that much of the criticism comes from those ignorant of what actually happened. He had in fact advocated the pursuit and it had been a 'good idea' of his, just not practicable in the circumstances, and that he was taking the advice of his more experienced generals. • Source B suggests there is no communication between Davies and his troops whereas Source C shows that he was listening to his commanders. **Explanation** *Source B is a contemporary newspaper report published in a Southern newspaper just after the events described in the report. Contextual knowledge would suggest that what is there, is largely accurate. While there was a degree of censorship and self-censorship in the South at the time, there is criticism and balance there which makes it a valid source.* *Source C is written by one of the Generals involved, about 10 years after the defeat of the South. The fact that he was a key player in the story makes it an important and useful source has to be balanced by the fact that there may be hindsight there, as well as a desire to enhance and defend his own role, and place the possible blame for failure elsewhere.* Accept any other valid responses.	**15**

Question	Answer	Marks
2(b)	**Read all the sources 'The Confederate Army had little chance of victory.' How far do the sources support this view?** Indicative content **Support:** • Source B mentions there are problems. There was a lack of confidence in the army commander at the time; there is mention of the army's 'poor performance' and there was the issue of the deserters. • Source C does begin to lay out the problems which the South faced when trying to take the offensive, as opposed to just defending itself against invasion by the North. There is evidence there of the absence of many of the things needed for a successful victory. Food, equipment and transport were specified. There is also the mention there of a 'fresh' Union army, just after it had been defeated elsewhere. • Source D highlights the lack of resources, and above all a good quality rifle. The source also specifies many of the other problems that the South faced as a result of its lack of resources. It mentioned the lack of crucial raw materials for waging war, such as copper and brass, as well as a lack of mechanical skills in the largely rural/cotton growing South. **Challenge:** • Source A does not support the hypothesis. It goes into a lot of detail of the many advantages held by the South, particularly when it came to its ability to defend itself. The source also mentions the very committed leadership and officer corps, the latter being quite a contrast to the North. There is also a very experienced chief, with much military and administrative experience, in the South. • Source B can be used to challenge hypothesis. There was a victory at Chickamauga this should suggest the possibility of a final victory. • Source C has some elements of challenge as it is suggested that Davies had enough skill to win battles and therefore the war. **Evaluation** *Source A – The source is written by a strong Northern supporter, who may well have been keen to defend his 'side' and play down the failings of the political and military leadership of the North in the early part of the war. However contextual knowledge would suggest that much of what he wrote was accurate.* *Source C – It is worth mentioning again that this Source was written by a defeated Southern general, after the war was over, who may have been trying to blame others and exonerate himself from blame.* *Source D – Although written well after the war was over, there is no reason to question the validity of the Source, as contextual knowledge reinforces it.* Accept any other valid responses.	**25**

Question	Answer	Marks
3(a)	**Compare and contrast these two sources as evidence of the impact of the May the Fourth demonstrations.** Indicative content **Similarities include:** • The fact that the protests led to strikes and shop closures, and a large section of the population was influenced by the students to participate. • The extent of the disruption. In Source B, the writer mentions the protesters were able to 'create trouble' while Source D includes references to 'traffic was almost blocked' and 'the police became powerless'. • Some success for the demonstrations: in Source B, it is implied that they attained 'their ends'; in Source D, they 'won their victory'. **Differences between Sources B and D include:** • In Source B, the focus is on 'the inconvenience caused' to foreigners by the strike, while Source D sees it as a triumph of direct action because the 'government finally gave in'. • Source B suggests that the riots were constrained by the use of 'armed force' to suppress the disturbances.' Whereas in Source D it suggested that the 'police became powerless'. • The long-term result in Source B is identified as teaching 'the Chinese the power of passive resistance' in challenging British interests and influence in Shanghai. Source D is interested in the way the students' victory encouraged continued protest 'against corruption in the government and old traditions.' **Evaluation** *The differences from the different concerns of the authors. The British community was influential in Shanghai, but anxiously aware that its power was decreasing. This is therefore the focus of the comments in Source B. The writer of D, as a member of the educated elite, is much more concerned with the impact on this group in society, and their success in defying the government.* *The similarities indicate the widespread impact and significance of the May the Fourth demonstrations, as does the fact each author identifies different long-term effects – increasing Chinese nationalism and support for radical change.* Accept any other valid responses.	**15**

Question	Answer	Marks
3(b)	**Read <u>all</u> the sources. How far do the sources support the view that Chinese nationalism was the main cause of the May the Fourth demonstrations?** **Indicative content** **Support:** • Source A supports the view, as it is provoked by the loss of Shandong to Japan at the Paris Peace Conference. It finishes with the claim that 'our country is about to be annihilated'. • Source B mainly supports the view, as the demonstrations are 'over the Shandong question' and there is the reference to the Chinese opposing British control with 'passive resistance'. • Source D supports, to some extent, as it shows the 'Versailles Treaty' as the trigger for the events of May the Fourth. **Challenge:** • Source A also has an element of challenge in the hostility to the government; a second aim is 'to get rid of the traitors at home'. However, this is because they are seen as failing to support national interests in the negotiations. There is also more radicalism in the proposal of 'citizens' meetings.' • Source B also offers some challenge, as it characterises many of the participants as 'the riff-raff and troublemakers', which suggests that the cause was partly a wish to create trouble. • Source C mainly challenges the view. Mao claims the actions were part of 'world revolution' inspired by Lenin, as many 'intellectuals' had 'the basics of Communist ideology'. He also interprets the demonstrations as a challenge to 'a government which oppressed the people'. Some support comes from the identification of the government's 'national betrayal', as it had 'sold out the interests of the nation'. • Source D challenges the view. Jiang Menglin puts the protests in the context of continuing student dissatisfaction with undemocratic and corrupt military government. **Explanation** *The support in Source A is an indication of the short-term cause of the demonstrations, which was the news from Paris about Shandong. This nationalist fervour would also have been safer to express than a more focused attack on the government. The indications of opposition to the government are shown in the anger with its lack of success.* *Source B shows the ambivalent view of the British residents. The main aim is to condemn the events, as it challenges their interests. This takes the form of both denouncing the 'trend of events in China' as concerted anti-foreign action arising from a hostile nationalism, and at the same time of implying lack of control by the students which led to mob 'rioting'.*	**25**

Question	Answer	Marks
3(b)	*Mao, in Source C, identifies his Communist movement with the popular memory of these demonstrations – even though he says 'the Communist Party had not yet come into existence'. In 1940, at a time of conflict with Japan and the Kuomintang, Mao speaks of the long-term strengths of his ideology and links it to opposition to oppressive governments which should be defied as they fail to protect the national interest.* *Jiang Menglin is clearly sympathetic to the students, and aims to show the significance of their protest in contributing to the rejection of the former government of China. As well as his identification, as an intellectual, with the students, he shows his support for 'the efforts of Dr Sun's party', which links to his later role in the Kuomintang.* *The sources show that outrage at Versailles provoked nationalist sentiment, which was the immediate cause of the May the Fourth events. However, this popular nationalism was in opposition to the national government, which Sources A, C and D* characterise *as not acting in the national interest. These three sources also point to a wish for radical change, on the part of the students, as a longer-term cause; these authors all support this development. Source B, from a British perspective, agrees in mentioning the Shandong issue, but sees the event as an anti-foreign riot rather than as a step to creating a more equal society.* Accept any other valid responses.	